

Supporting Survivors of Human Trafficking

Date: May 10, 2019
To: Economic and Community Development Committee
From: Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration
Wards: All

SUMMARY

This report provides information regarding the City's efforts to support survivors of human trafficking.

The recommendations will aim to ensure relevant City programs and services are able to identify and assist survivors of human trafficking in a manner consistent with the City's "anti-human-trafficking lens." An "anti-human trafficking lens" puts the person being trafficked, or at risk of being trafficked, at the centre and prioritizes their safety, well-being and human rights.

The recommendations focus on increased staff training, as well as the creation of a specialized support team to do outreach to people who may be at risk of human trafficking or who may experience other vulnerabilities related to sex work.

The report also provides information about human trafficking and consensual sex work in Toronto. It highlights the importance of understanding the difference between human trafficking and consensual sex work in order to establish and meet policy and program objectives.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration recommends that:

1. City Council direct the Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration and the Executive Director, Municipal Licencing and Standards, in collaboration with the Medical Officer of Health, and in consultation with community stakeholders, to develop an outreach model and determine an appropriate pilot strategy for reaching workers in workplaces in which people may be at risk of human trafficking or other vulnerabilities related to sex work for the purpose of building trusting relationships, providing support and referrals to relevant services, and informing workers of their rights.

2. City Council direct the Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration, in consultation with the Medical Officer of Health, to adapt Toronto Public Health's online Human Trafficking Awareness Training module and make available to appropriate frontline, supervisory and management staff at all relevant and interested City Agencies, Corporations and Divisions, including Toronto Employment and Social Services, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, Municipal Licencing and Standards, Children's Services, Toronto Public Library, and Toronto Community Housing.

3. City Council direct the Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration to coordinate the distribution of posters regarding the human trafficking helpline(s) to all relevant and interested City Agencies, Corporations and Divisions, including Toronto Employment and Social Services, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, Municipal Licencing and Standards, Children's Services, Toronto Public Library, and Toronto Community Housing.

4. City Council request the Government of Ontario to continue to support anti-human trafficking initiatives, including new and ongoing supportive housing and programs for survivors of human trafficking.

5. City Council forward a copy of this report to the Provincial Anti-Human Trafficking Coordination Office, the Minister of Children, Community and Social Services, the Minister of the Attorney General, the Minister of Labour, the Minister of Health and Long-Term Care, the Minister of Indigenous Affairs, and the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no financial impacts resulting from this report. Any current and future costs associated with the outreach model and frontline staff training will be covered within existing resources.

The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

In July 2018, City Council adopted the CD30.5 Portable Housing Benefit - Special Priority Policy (PHB - SPP) Program Extension. The report recommended that City Council approve the receipt of \$250,000 ongoing for housing assistance for households included in the special priority category under the Housing Services Act, 2011. City Council also authorized the General Manager, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration to enter into a Transfer Payment Agreement with the Ministry of Housing and/or the Ministry of Finance to facilitate the delivery of the Portable Housing Benefit - Special Priority Policy Program and to extend the program beyond 2020.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2018.CD30.5>

In April 2018, City Council adopted LS24.2 Work Plan for Review of Chapter 545, Licensing, Body-Rub Parlours and Holistic Centres. The report recommended staff to complete a comprehensive review of body-rub parlours and holistic centre regulations, and to use an anti-human trafficking lens to protect public health and safety.
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2018.LS24.2>

In December 2017, City Council adopted EX29.15 New Supports and Housing for Survivors of Human Trafficking. The report recommended that City Council enter into an administration agreement with the Ministry of Housing and the Ministry of Community and Social Services for the receipt and expenditure of funding under the Anti-Human Trafficking Community Supports Fund and the Investment in Affordable Housing Program.
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2017.EX29.15>

In March and April 2015, City Council adopted EX4.8 Providing Property Tax Exemption for New Transitional Housing for Young Victims of Sexual Exploitation and Human Trafficking. The report recommended that City Council exempt eight units from property taxes for a period of 15 years.
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2015.EX4.8>

In June 2014, City Council adopted EX42.17 New Transitional Housing for Young Victims of Sexual Exploitation and Human Trafficking that recommended up to \$0.850 million in financial assistance for the capital repairs of a Toronto Community Housing property to provide transitional housing for young women who are survivors of sexual exploitation and human trafficking.
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.EX42.17>

In June 2014, City Council adopted CD29.11 Access to City Services for Undocumented Torontonians, and reaffirmed its commitment to ensuring access to services without fear to residents without full status or full status documents (undocumented Torontonians).
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.CD29.11>

In December 2013, City Council adopted EX36.13 Initiatives to Address Human Trafficking that recommended staff continue to work with all stakeholders to raise public awareness, increase services and supports for trafficked persons, and increase efforts to prevent human trafficking.
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.EX36.13>

COMMENTS

Background

Over the last decade concern regarding human trafficking in Canada has grown. Governments, law enforcement bodies, community groups, survivors of human trafficking, sex workers, and businesses have engaged in robust discussion about how to best prevent human trafficking, support survivors of human trafficking and avoid increasing the vulnerability and risks faced by people engaged in consensual sex work. A broad range of approaches have been implemented across the country including, but

not limited to: the establishment of dedicated anti-human trafficking police task forces, the development of specialized services for survivors of human trafficking, and the review of police and Bylaw enforcement approaches that impact people engaged in consensual sex work.

In Toronto, human trafficking for the purposes of forced sexual labour has received significant attention.

Human trafficking is a complex issue. The hidden nature of the crime means that there is limited data with which to fully describe and understand the problem. From the available data and anecdotal information, which includes information provided by survivors of human trafficking, sex workers, and the Toronto Police Service, it is clear that human trafficking occurs throughout Toronto, in licensed establishments, as well as unlicensed establishments, hotels, condos, short-term rentals, cars, streets, private residences, and several other locations. Consensual sex work occurs in most of these locations as well.

Human trafficking, specifically forced sexual labour, and consensual sex work are different. Distinguishing between the two is essential for developing clear public policy objectives and effective implementation. Understanding the difference is also necessary to avoid undermining the safety and well-being of people engaged in consensual sex work.

Human trafficking

The Criminal Code of Canada defines human trafficking as recruiting, transporting, transferring, receiving, holding, concealing or harboring a person, or exercising control, direction or influence over the movements of a person, for the purpose of exploiting them or facilitating their exploitation (The Criminal Code of Canada, section 279.01).

Human trafficking includes forced sexual labour, forced labour, and forced marriage.

Consensual sex work

Sex work is the consensual exchange of sexual services for money or other consideration between adults.

Survival sex is sex work performed by people in extreme need. It involves trading sexual services for food, shelter, drugs or other basic needs.

Distinctions between consensual sex work and human trafficking

A broad range of stakeholders are concerned about the conflation of consensual sex work and human trafficking. While consensual sex work may include some elements of exploitation, as many forms of work do, it is distinct from human trafficking in that the "worker" is not coerced. There is general agreement that anti-human trafficking measures should focus on people who are being coerced and controlled.

When consensual sex work is conflated with human trafficking, there is often increased surveillance of sex work and efforts to "rescue" sex workers. Avoiding conflating

consensual sex work and human trafficking is important so that sex workers are not further surveilled, stigmatized, criminalized¹, and forced underground, resulting in greater marginalization and isolation. The more socially and physically isolated sex workers are, the more vulnerable they are to violence and exploitation. Relatedly, providing access to services and resources that promote harm reduction to people engaged in consensual sex work both supports sex workers' well-being and provides opportunities for sex workers to build relationships that may be useful if they choose to leave the sex industry and/or if they experience violence or exploitation.

Stakeholder consultations

Stakeholders have a variety of perspectives regarding the best ways to address human trafficking. A summary of the key findings of the Social Development, Finance and Administration's recent consultations on human trafficking is summarized in Appendix A. A list of the stakeholders who were consulted is found in Appendix B.

While some of the perspectives are divergent, there are several points of general agreement.

- Individuals and authorities who are likely to come into contact with people who are being trafficked or who are at risk of being trafficked must prioritize building trusting relationships rather than Bylaw or law enforcement that may result in the criminalization, stigmatization and/or increased vulnerability of the people providing the sexual services (coerced or not).
- Anti-human trafficking measures need to include investments in housing, childcare, and social, health and employment services for survivors.
- Stigmatization associated with sex work and human trafficking is a significant barrier to accessing social and health services.

Preventing human trafficking

Some people with lived experience of consensual sex work as well as survivors of human trafficking, anti-human trafficking advocates and researchers express concern that significant exploitation, grooming, and trafficking is occurring in licensed Body Rub Parlours and holistic centres as well as other sites, such as schools and group homes. They emphasized several points.

- Government must use all available levers and opportunities to identify and prevent human trafficking.
- Governments are licencing businesses in which illegal, dangerous sex work and human trafficking are occurring.
- Robust licensing regimes that ensure only legitimate businesses are granted licences, effective Bylaw and law enforcement, and a public registry of licensed establishments in the adult entertainment industry as well as of Body Rub Parlours and holistic centres are required.

¹ Throughout this report, the terms 'criminalization' and 'criminalized' refer to the surveillance of sex work, related charges that may be laid either by law enforcement or bylaw enforcement, and/or the resulting experience of sex workers of being seen and treated as criminals in society. The terms are not used in a strictly legal sense.

- People working in high risk industries need to be provided with information about their rights in a manner that is culturally and linguistically appropriate, and sensitive to their vulnerability.
- Make housing, as well as childcare and culturally relevant and trauma-informed health, social and employment services available to people who are survivors of human trafficking and people who wish to leave the sex industry, and
- The stigma of sex work and human trafficking prevents many people from accessing the support and care they want. As a result, anti-human trafficking initiatives need to be designed and implemented in a manner that does not increase the marginalization, stigma and shame of survivors.

Undermining sex workers' rights and well-being

Other sex workers, sex workers' advocates and researchers stress that the stigmatization and criminalization of consensual sex work and enforcement conducted by police and municipal Bylaw enforcement officers increases the vulnerability of sex workers and undermines their safety, well-being and human rights. They stressed several points.

- Heavy surveillance and enforcement approaches, as well as anti-human trafficking campaigns that stigmatize sex work, result in the physical and social isolation of sex workers. Consequently, sex workers are forced further "underground" into spaces that are more remote and more dangerous.
- Sex workers are safer when they are able to stay connected to other people and perform their work in closer proximity to other people.
- The City should implement approaches that avoid increasing the danger sex workers may experience in their work, and prioritize increasing sex workers' access to health, safety and social services, as well awareness of their rights.

Several stakeholders referred to approaches used in Vancouver. In response to the missing and murdered women from Vancouver's Downtown Eastside, the Missing Women Commission of Inquiry was established, as well as several other reviews and studies. As a result of this work, the city changed its response to sex work. In 2010, the Vancouver Police Department adopted an approach that avoids criminalizing sex work and sex workers, instead emphasizing relationship building and safety promotion. In 2015, the City of Vancouver adopted Sex Work Response Guidelines "to promote a respectful, non-discriminatory and consistent approach among City of Vancouver employees who interact with anyone in the sex industry" (Sex Work Response Guidelines). The Guidelines also emphasize the City of Vancouver's opposition to all forms of human trafficking and youth sexual exploitation. In 2017, the British Columbia Association of Chiefs of Police adapted the Vancouver guidelines, creating the British Columbia Association of Chiefs of Police Sex Work Enforcement Guidelines.

Toronto Police Service: Sex work and human trafficking

The Toronto Police Service's response to sex work is one that prioritizes protecting people who are victims of human trafficking and sexual exploitation. Over the last six years, enforcement efforts related to sex work have increasingly been focussed on human trafficking and sexual exploitation of children rather than people engaged in consensual sex work. Data from the Toronto Police Service demonstrates that charges

and convictions related to sex work are focussed on human trafficking and exploitation. Toronto Police Service data related to human trafficking is provided in Appendix C.

According to the Toronto Police Service, since 2014, there have been no charges laid against sex workers. In this same time period, during three different undercover operations, there were charges laid against six men who attempted to buy sexual services from a person under 18 years. The six men were convicted. This offence relates to the purchaser of sexual services, not the person selling sexual services.

The Toronto Police Service indicates that it has anecdotal information that there is both human trafficking and consensual sex work occurring in licenced Body Rub Parlours, holistic centres, and locations throughout the city.

The Toronto Police Service's Human Trafficking Enforcement Team leads intelligence-driven investigations that focus on human trafficking; investigations do not focus on people engaged in consensual sex work. See below for more information about the Toronto Police Service's Human Trafficking Enforcement Team.

Anti-human trafficking lens

An anti-human trafficking lens puts the person being trafficked, or at risk of being trafficked, at the centre and prioritizes their safety, well-being, and human rights.

From a municipal perspective, an anti-human trafficking lens needs to include at least four significant considerations. Below is an explanation of the key considerations, followed by a description of the City's current activities, which are guided by this lens.

1. How can the City identify people who are being trafficked?

The City of Toronto has many potential points of contact with people who are being trafficked or who may be at risk of being trafficked. These include: shelters, housing sites, parks, recreation programs, sexual health clinics, employment and social services offices, youth programs, and libraries. By-law enforcement officers and police officers may also have contact with people being trafficked or who are at risk of being trafficked.

The City can ensure staff are trained to identify risk factors and indicators of human trafficking and provide appropriate support and/or referrals. Training can also help staff understand the differences between consensual sex work and human trafficking, and the risks of conflating the two.

In consultation with community stakeholders, the City can develop an outreach model and determine an appropriate pilot strategy for reaching workers in workplaces in which people may be at risk of human trafficking or other vulnerabilities related to sex work for the purpose of building trusting relationships, providing support and referrals to relevant services, and informing workers of their rights.

2. How can the City support survivors of human trafficking?

The City has many services and programs that may support the safety, well-being and human rights of survivors of human trafficking. These include: emergency shelter,

support accessing supportive and permanent housing, sexual health services, Ontario Works, employment supports, and childcare.

Because survivors of human trafficking have specific needs and face particular barriers, the City can aim to ensure relevant City services are accessible and helpful to survivors of human trafficking.

3. How can the City prevent human trafficking?

The City has potential points of contact with people who are being trafficked or who may be at risk of being trafficked, as noted above.

The City may be able to contribute to the prevention of human trafficking by training staff who are working with vulnerable populations to identify risk factors and indicators of trafficking, and adopting law enforcement approaches focussed on human trafficking.

4. How can the City avoid conflating human trafficking and consensual sex work, and thereby increasing the vulnerability of people engaged in consensual sex work?

The City has many potential points of contact with people engaged in consensual sex work. These include: shelters, housing sites, parks, recreation programs, sexual health clinics, child care centres, employment and social services offices, and libraries. By-law enforcement officers and police officers are also likely to have contact with people engaged in consensual sex work.

The City can develop policy, program, and enforcement approaches that avoid conflating human trafficking and consensual sex work. The City can also establish guidelines and processes for City staff that contribute to a culture and service approach that reduces harm and stigmatization of sex workers in favour of relationship building and promoting service access.

City of Toronto's current anti-human trafficking actions

Since 2013, Social Development, Finance and Administration has led the City's Steering Committee to Address Human Trafficking. The interdivisional team focusses on: sharing information and resources related to human trafficking, increasing services for human trafficking survivors, increasing City staff understanding of human trafficking, and coordinating the City's work related to human trafficking. A list of the Steering Committee members may be found in Appendix D.

On behalf of the City of Toronto, staff from Social Development, Finance and Administration participate in two local committees to address human trafficking: Covenant House Toronto Sex Trafficking Committee, and the Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network. Starting in 2019, City staff will also be participating in an Advisory Committee for an initiative led by The Hospital for Sick Children's Suspected Child Abuse and Neglect Program to develop and implement a cross-sector community response protocol to more effectively address the commercial sex trafficking of vulnerable children and youth in Toronto.

The City's work related to human trafficking falls into the four main categories of the anti-human trafficking lens outlined above: 1) identifying people being or at-risk of being trafficked, 2) supporting survivors of human trafficking, 3) preventing human trafficking, and 4) avoiding increasing the vulnerability of people engaged in consensual sex work. Below is a summary of the key work that has been done in each of these categories.

Identifying people being or at-risk of being trafficked

- **Furthering Our Communities Uniting Services Toronto Situation Tables:** Led by the City of Toronto, United Way Greater Toronto and the Toronto Police Service, Furthering Our Communities Uniting Services Toronto Situation tables bring together professionals from multiple sectors at weekly meetings for the purpose of identifying individuals and families at high risk for crime, victimization and/or harm. Members of the table coordinate customized services to meet the urgent and specific needs of the identified residents. In 2018, 28 youth who were being trafficked, groomed or who were attempting to leave the sex industry were identified and provided with services to meet their specific needs.
- **Staff training:** Staff in several divisions have received basic training on indicators of human trafficking and appropriate approaches to supporting survivors of trafficking. All frontline staff in Toronto Public Health now participate in an online training module. Some staff in the following divisions have also received basic training: Municipal Licencing and Standards, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration, and Social Development, Finance and Administration.
- **Awareness raising:** Over the last six years, City staff have organized over 30 meetings to build community organizations' awareness of human trafficking and the services available to survivors.

Since 2017, the Mayor has also proclaimed a day in May as Human Trafficking Awareness Day.

Supporting survivors of human trafficking

- **Service access:** The City has many services, as noted above, that may be useful to survivors of human trafficking. However, some people may be fearful of accessing services because they do not have immigration status. The City's Access Toronto policy is relevant. In February 2013, City Council affirmed its commitment to ensuring access to services to all Torontonians, including those without full status or without full status documents.
- **Access to shelter:** When a human trafficking survivor has escaped or been identified and supported to leave, access to a safe place in which they can receive specialized support is essential.

Shelter, Support and Housing Administration funds Covenant House Toronto (Covenant House) to maintain two emergency beds that are dedicated exclusively to survivors of human trafficking. These beds are in addition to the beds that are available in Covenant House's transition homes, which are discussed below.

- **Access to housing:** Access to housing is important because it can provide human trafficking survivors with a safe place to live and support to heal. Stable housing is also a preventative measure because homelessness and/or unstable housing can make people vulnerable to exploitation and trafficking.

In 2014, the Affordable Housing Office and Toronto Community Housing partnered with Covenant House to develop the first specialized transitional home for survivors of sex trafficking in Toronto. The City invested \$1.05 million of capital funding for repairs. In September 2016, the Rogers Transitional Home opened with a capacity to house up to six women aged 16 to 24. The Home provides 24-hour, on-site support with a live-in female staff person and two child and youth workers. Women are able to remain at the home for a maximum of two years. To date, the Rogers Home has housed 15 young women.

In spring 2017, the Ministry of Children, Community and Social Services launched a new Anti-Human Trafficking Community Supports Fund. On behalf of the City, Social Development, Finance and Administration, in collaboration with the Affordable Housing Office, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration and the Toronto Police Service completed an application to the Fund to support Avdell Home, also run by Covenant House. Avdell Home, which opened in November 2018, supports up to six young women who are survivors human trafficking. Through the Fund, Ministry of Children, Community and Social Services and the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing provided the City with one-time funding of \$0.885 million for capital repairs as well as \$0.885 million, over two years, to support Covenant House to provide wrap-around services at Avdell Home. Additionally, the province provides a total of \$0.238 million in operating funding for six fixed rate rent supplements for the youth that are residing at the Avdell Home. The funding period for the rent supplement funding is from November 1, 2018 to March 31, 2024.

In 2017, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration participated in the review of the provincial Housing Services Act, 2011. Shelter, Support and Housing Administration supported changes to the provincial Special Priority Policy to include survivors of human trafficking. The Special Priority Policy provides priority access to social housing to households fleeing abusive relationships who are unable to afford rent in the private market, and now, as a result of a policy amendment, includes survivors of human trafficking. To date, the City has approved applications for 21 survivors of human trafficking for access to Rent-Geared-to-Income housing, under the new amendment.

Through the provincial Home for Good Program, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration funds the Native Canadian Centre of Toronto to provide housing supports, specialized service, and rent supplements to 50 Indigenous youth under the age of 24 with addictions and/or who are survivors of human trafficking.

- **Access to income:** Toronto Employment and Social Services has established several policies to support individuals who are vulnerable and at-risk of exploitation, including human trafficking survivors. For example, within eligibility for Ontario Works, procedures are in place that permit the waiver of documentation

requirements on a short term basis when information is not readily available due to circumstances beyond a person's control.

Individuals without immigration status in Canada can access Toronto Employment and Social Services Employment Centres, and apply for financial support through the Hardship Fund or Emergency Energy Fund that is administered by Toronto Employment and Social Services. Additionally, Toronto Employment and Social Services Service Delivery Guidelines ensure clients are connected to relevant support services and community resources.

- **Access to health services:** Sexual health clinics run by Toronto Public Health provide a variety of services including: HIV testing, sexually transmitted infections' testing and treatment, pregnancy testing, as well as low cost or free birth control. These clinics are available to everyone, including people engaged in sex work. Toronto Public Health recognizes that people being trafficked or at risk of being trafficked may seek assistance from frontline Toronto Public Health staff. As such, all new and returning frontline Toronto Public Health staff are required to participate in an online Human Trafficking Awareness training.

The Hospital for Sick Children's Suspected Child Abuse and Neglect Program was approved for funding from the federal government's Gender Based Violence Program. The City of Toronto, represented by Social Development, Finance and Administration, supported a successful application. The five-year project will develop, implement, and evaluate a cross-sector community response protocol to more effectively address the commercial sex trafficking of vulnerable children and youth in Toronto. The ultimate objective of the project is to improve the quality, integration, coordination, and consistency of care provided to young survivors and their families. City staff will participate in the project's Child and Youth Sex Trafficking Community Advisory Committee.

- **Trauma-informed services:** Through Social Development, Finance and Administration's Community Funding Unit, Elizabeth Fry Toronto has been funded to develop and distribute a resource guide for counsellors working with survivors of human trafficking. This will be completed in 2019.
- **Understanding service needs:** The Social Development, Finance and Administration's Community Funding Unit funded Findhelp/211 to work with service providers to collect data that on the needs of human trafficking survivors.

Preventing human trafficking

- **Toronto Police Service's Human Trafficking Enforcement Team:** In 2013, the Toronto Police Service established the Human Trafficking Enforcement Team, a subsection of the Sex Crimes Unit. Its mandate is the investigation, arrest, and prosecution of traffickers. The Human Trafficking Enforcement Team is an operational unit which conducts multi-jurisdictional investigations primarily involving domestic human trafficking crimes, in particular sex trafficking. The Human Trafficking Enforcement Team currently consists of two teams of investigators each managed by a Detective, and supervised by a Detective Sergeant. The Human Trafficking Enforcement Team is familiar with concerns regarding the conflation of

human trafficking and consensual sex work. As noted above, the Toronto Police Service's approach largely focusses on human trafficking and sexual exploitation of children, rather than consensual sex work.

Using an intelligence driven approach, the Human Trafficking Enforcement Team has charged 295 people with charges related to human trafficking over the last six years, resulting in 56 convictions, and identification of 250 victims. (Appendix C.)

The Human Trafficking Enforcement Team works closely with community partners to ensure victims of human trafficking receive appropriate support as quickly as possible. The Human Trafficking Enforcement Team does not report undocumented people to the Canada Border Services Agency.

In addition to leading investigations, the Human Trafficking Enforcement Team provides mandatory training at the Toronto Police College, Ontario Police College and Canadian Police College.

- **Specialized outreach:** Through Social Development, Finance and Administration's Community Funding Unit, the City funds Aura Freedom, a peer-led community organization, to provide workshops to youth in schools, youth shelters and group homes. The purpose of the workshops is to provide education and awareness about human trafficking to vulnerable youth. By the end of 2019, City of Toronto funding will have enabled Aura Freedom to deliver at least 30 workshops, reaching approximately 1,000 youth.
- **Proposed Bylaw amendments relating to safety in Body Rub Parlours:** Municipal Licensing and Standards Division is undertaking a review of the Body Rub Parlour and holistic licensing Bylaws, which is being submitted to the General Government and Licensing Committee on May 21, 2019. The anti-human trafficking lens developed by Social Development, Finance and Administration was considered in the development of the report.

Avoiding increasing vulnerability of sex workers

- **Toronto Police Service:** As noted above, the Toronto Police Service strives to avoid conflating human trafficking and consensual sex work. The Toronto Police Service, led by the Human Trafficking Enforcement Team, is largely focussed on human trafficking and sexual exploitation of children, rather than consensual sex work.
- **Outreach to sex workers:** Through Toronto Public Health, the Toronto Urban Health Fund supports the Massage Parlour/Micro-Brothel Outreach Initiative. This three year project funds a coordinator and three peer workers to provide culturally and linguistically specific outreach and support to sex workers. The Toronto Urban Health Fund also supports the Indigenous Sex Workers' Action project, which provides outreach, and monthly sharing circles with Elders.

Through Social Development Finance and Administration's Community Funding Unit and the Toronto Urban Health Fund, Butterfly: Asian and Migrant Sex Workers Network has been funded to conduct an assessment of migrant sex workers' needs,

develop resources for sex workers and service providers about sex workers' rights and services available to them, build a sex worker-led support network, and promote harm reduction practices.

A full list of the community partners receiving grants from the City to address human trafficking is provided in Appendix E.

- **Access to shelter:** Shelter, Support and Housing Administration has made several efforts to make overnight shelter space more accessible, non-judgemental, and safe for sex workers. The Shelter Standards have been updated to ensure people who work overnight shifts, including doing sex work, have access to service and a place to sleep during the day. Additionally, two 24-hour women's drop-ins have been opened to meet the needs of vulnerable and street involved women who may not access the emergency shelter system, including sex workers. Additional capacity has been added to the 24-hour respite sites that provide a low-barrier service for people who may not access the regular shelter system, including sex workers.
- **Staff training:** The training curricula available to City of Toronto staff includes explanations of the difference between human trafficking and consensual sex work, and the risks of conflating the two.
- **Cooperative approach:** Municipal Licensing and Standards has instituted a co-operative enforcement model which involves a focus on collaborating with key community partners. Municipal Licensing and Standards is taking an approach which prioritizes education and outreach, community partnership, before resorting to legal enforcement tools.

Next steps

Human trafficking is a serious and complex issue. For the City of Toronto to have the greatest impact, it is necessary to focus on what the City can do with its levers.

The recommendations in this report support the City's continued collaboration with community partners for the purposes of sharing information and aligning efforts to meet the specific needs of survivors of human trafficking.

The recommendations help ensure that City staff who may interact with survivors of human trafficking and/or people who are at risk of being trafficked are appropriately trained to recognize indicators of human trafficking and respond appropriately.

Additionally, the recommendations request that the provincial government provide ongoing and new support for specialized housing and related supports for survivors of human trafficking.

Finally, the recommendations in this report enable the City to use its specific expertise and relationships to explore models and opportunities for a community-based support team to outreach to workplaces in which people may be at risk of human trafficking or other vulnerabilities related to sex work. The purpose of this outreach is to: build trusting relationships, provide support and referrals to relevant services, and inform workers of their rights.

Other Orders of Government

The City collaborates with the provincial and federal governments to respond to the needs of survivors of human trafficking.

Government of Ontario

In 2016, the provincial government launched Ontario's Strategy to End Human Trafficking and established the Provincial Anti-Human Trafficking Coordination Office.

In September 2017, the provincial government invested approximately \$18.6 million, over three years, to 44 partners and agencies across the province for projects that aim to prevent human trafficking and support survivors. The City of Toronto received \$2 million to support two specialized programs for human trafficking survivors run by Covenant House. In total, there were seven projects funded in Toronto. A list of funded projects in Toronto is provided in Appendix F.

Additionally, in collaboration with the City of Toronto and community partners, the provincial government funded a provincial helpline for survivors of human trafficking and those seeking to support them. The helpline is operated by Findhelp/211 Central Region, a 24/7 community information and referral service. Recently, the federal government announced funding for a national hotline. (See below.)

Government of Canada

The National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking was completed in 2016. In September 2018, Public Safety Canada hosted a national summit: The Way Forward to End Human Trafficking in Canada. The national discussion engaged a broad range of stakeholders in a discussion about the creation of a new national strategy to end human trafficking.

In October 2018, Public Safety Canada announced that The Canadian Centre to End Human Trafficking was the successful applicant to coordinate the creation of a national hotline to support survivors of human trafficking. It is expected to launch in 2019. The federal government reaffirmed its commitment to developing a "new whole-of-government strategy to combat human trafficking," in the 2019 federal budget.

CONTACT

Sarah Blackstock
Manager, Social Policy
Social Development, Finance and Administration, (416) 392-8291
Sarah.Blackstock@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Chris Brillinger
Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration

ATTACHMENTS

Appendix A: Summary of Community Consultations
Appendix B: Community Consultations - Stakeholders List
Appendix C: Toronto Police Service Data
Appendix D: Members of City of Toronto's Steering Committee to Address Human Trafficking
Appendix E: Community partners receiving City of Toronto grants to address human trafficking
Appendix F: Government of Ontario Funded Programs

APPENDIX A: Summary of Community Consultations

During the past 6 years, Social Development, Finance and Administration staff have consulted with survivors of human trafficking, sex workers (prior and current), community groups, and academics. They also participate on the Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network and the Covenant House Toronto Sex Trafficking Committee.

In December 2018, Social Development, Finance and Administration staff held a formal community consultation with several survivors of human trafficking and community partners that serve survivors of human trafficking. A total of 29 participants attended and members of the City's Steering Committee to Address Human Trafficking also attended. The objective of the consultation was to obtain input from the participants on specific City services that would support survivors of human trafficking.

In addition, between February and March, 2019, 11 one-on-one conference calls were conducted with community agencies and academics across the country, City of Vancouver staff, and former and current sex workers. Social Development, Finance and Administration staff also participated in consultations conducted by Municipal Licensing and Standards, a summary of which can be found in their May 2019 report, [GL5.2 Review of Body Rub Parlour and Holistic Centres Bylaws - Consultation and Research Findings, to be considered at the General Government and Licensing Committee meeting on May 21, 2019.](#)

A summary of the Social Development, Finance and Administration consultations is provided below. A list of the stakeholders is provided in Appendix B.

Support for Survivors of Human Trafficking

- Stakeholders stated that human trafficking is occurring in licensed and unlicensed Body Rub Parlours and holistic centres across Toronto, as well as many other locations. They also expressed concern and frustration that the City is licencing establishments in which illegal, dangerous sex work and trafficking is occurring. They stressed the need for the City and other levels of government to collaborate to ensure government is not enabling trafficking and exploitation. They suggested more robust licencing regimes, more intentional enforcement and increased public availability of information, including the names of the registered owners, related to the adult entertainment industry, Body Rub Parlours and holistic centres.
- Human trafficking survivors who previously worked in the sex industry indicated that processes should be established that provide authorities with greater opportunity to recognize indicators of human trafficking. They also suggested that changes could be made to the application process to allow people being exploited to gain access to information and potentially disclose concerns. At the same time, survivors pointed out that vulnerable and trafficked people do not always identify as trafficked, or recognize their exploitative situations and therefore, may not seek help.
- Stakeholders emphasized that it is important to identify specific approaches to supporting Indigenous peoples who are survivors of human trafficking, as well as

those who may be traffickers. It is essential to work with community partners that serve First Nations, Inuit and Métis peoples.

- Stakeholders emphasized the significance of the stigma of human trafficking and sex work. They stressed that the stigma, shame and marginalization experienced by survivors is often a major barrier that prevents people from accessing services and supports. The stakeholders suggested that anti-human trafficking initiatives need to be developed and implemented carefully in order to avoid increasing the stigma and shame experienced by survivors.
- Stakeholders stated that the City should provide information on ways for survivors of human trafficking to access Ontario Works and to support them in obtaining personal identification, if required.
- Stakeholders emphasized the need to increase the availability of transitional housing and long-term housing support for survivors of human trafficking.
- Human trafficking survivors stated that supportive measures to address human trafficking should include access to housing as well as health and social services.
- Stakeholders stressed the need for intelligence-driven enforcement measures that target human traffickers.
- Stakeholders stressed the need for service providers to build trusting relationships with people at risk of being trafficked. There were various suggestions for dedicated teams of support workers to conduct outreach to vulnerable workers, with an emphasis on building relationships and providing information about services and rights.
- Stakeholders stressed the need for decision-makers and law enforcement to avoid trying to "rescue" victims, suggesting this does little more than feed saviour complexes rooted in misogyny and racism.

Respect for Sex Workers

- Sex workers and advocacy organizations emphasized that sex work and human trafficking must not be conflated. They also stressed that they are concerned that the prevalence of human trafficking is overstated.
- Sex workers and advocacy organizations stated that sex work has benefits over many other forms of work, including: the ability to choose clients, flexible hours, and financial independence.
- Sex workers and advocacy organizations stressed that an enforcement-based anti-human trafficking approach has negative impacts on sex workers because it increases their risks of harassment and abuse by Bylaw enforcement and police. They suggested it is preferable to use a labour and human rights lens because it focuses on the health, safety and rights of both survivors of human trafficking and sex workers.

- Sex workers and advocacy organizations stated that like any other workers, sex workers may experience forms of harassment and exploitation. Stakeholders stressed that the Ontario's Employment and Standards Act and Occupational Health and Safety Act also applies to sex workers.
- Sex workers reported that they sometimes feel unwelcome when they are using public spaces because they are harassed by the public and/or the police.
- Sex workers and advocacy organizations stated that sex workers sometimes experience judgement and shame in the shelter system. They recommended efforts be made to create more inclusive, non-judgmental and safe spaces.

Business Licensing

- Municipal Licensing and Standards conducted public and stakeholder consultations. A summary of the stakeholders' input on business licensing can be found in the Municipal Licensing and Standards report, [GL5.2 Review of Body Rub Parlour and Holistic Centres Bylaws - Consultation and Research Findings, to be considered at the General Government and Licensing Committee meeting on May 21, 2019.](#)

Enforcement and Policing

- Sex workers and advocacy organizations stated that police and Bylaw enforcement demonstrate systemic discrimination towards sex workers and this is amplified if the person is Indigenous, Asian, Black and/or trans. It was expressed that officers are targeting the most vulnerable sex workers (marginalized, low income), not the middle class or upscale sex workers that work in the privacy of their homes or as escorts.
- Sex workers and advocacy organizations suggested that enforcement staff need to receive community-delivered anti-discrimination training.
- Stakeholders stated that there are other forms of "labour" trafficking, not only sex trafficking that require the attention of police and Bylaw enforcement.
- Stakeholders stressed the need to fully decriminalize sex work.

City Staff Training

- Stakeholders recommended increased staff training to ensure City staff can identify indicators of human trafficking, and respond appropriately. They also stressed that training needs to address the differences between consensual sex work and human trafficking and the risks of conflating the two.

Funding for Community and Support Services

- Stakeholders suggested that the same community agencies that provide trauma-informed support to survivors of human trafficking should also support sex workers

when they seek help. It was suggested that the City should invest in social supports and other community-based programs that would help enhance the quality of life of survivors of human trafficking, as well as sex workers.

- Sex workers and advocacy organizations suggested that sex workers' organizations need to be funded to create peer support programs and/or diversion programs that are available for sex workers, which would include access to harm reduction services.
- It was suggested that an Advisory Table comprised of survivors of human trafficking, advocacy organizations, and current and prior sex workers is needed to inform City staff, law enforcement officers, and community agencies of the service approaches that will best support the needs of both human trafficking survivors and sex workers.

Appendix B: Community Consultations - Stakeholders List

In addition to the list of organizations listed below, people with lived experience of human trafficking were consulted. They requested their names not be used.

Aboriginal Legal Services Toronto
ARISE Ministry
Aura Freedom International
Aurora House
Boost Child and Youth Advocacy Centre
Bridgenorth
Butterfly: Asian and Migrant Sex Workers Support Network
Canadian Alliance for Sex Work Law Reform
Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network
Canadian Women's Foundation
Children Aid Societies in Toronto
Chinese Canadian National Council Toronto
Chinese and Southeast Asian Legal Clinic
City of Vancouver
Covenant House Toronto (staff) and the Sex Trafficking Advisory Committee members
Delta Family Resource Centre
East Metro Youth Services
Elizabeth Fry Toronto
FCJ Refugee Centre
Findhelp Information Services / 211 Central Region
Free Them
Human Trafficking Intervention Prevention Strategy – coordinated by East Metro Youth Services
Immigration and Refugee Services Ontario Central East Division
Income Security Advocacy Centre
Interval House
John Howard Society of Toronto
Maggie's Toronto Sex Worker Action Project
Migrant Workers Mobile Program
Ministry for Social Justice, Peace and Care of Earth with the Sisters of St. Joseph of Toronto
Native Child and Family Services of Toronto
Native Women's Resource Centre of Toronto
Operation Springboard
Red Umbrella Fund
Rexdale Women's Centre
Rise Initiative
Sex Professionals of Canada
Sex Trade 101
Sisters of St. Joseph of Toronto
Support Women's Alternative Network
The Bad Date Coalition
The Canadian Centre to End Human Trafficking
The Holistic Practitioner's Alliance
The Hospital for Sick Children

The Salvation Army

The Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network – coordinated by FCJ Refugee Centre
University of Victoria, Canadian Institute for Substance Use Research, Research on the
Contexts of Health, Safety and Care among Sex Workers

Woman Abuse Council of Toronto

Women's Habitat of Etobicoke

Yorktown Shelter for Women

Appendix C: Toronto Police Service Data

The Toronto Police Service's Human Trafficking Enforcement Team has been collecting data since 2014.

Table One - Toronto Police Service Data on Human Trafficking Enforcement from 2014-2018.

Classification	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Total
Charges Laid	365	463	529	373	410	2140
Occurrence	149	170	236	253	284	1092
Arrests	59	61	77	52	46	295
Victims	33	30	67	60	60	250
Convictions	11	11	8	14	12	56

Charges laid are multiple offences committed by the offender. The offences will always be a combination of human trafficking, and weapons, drugs, physical assault, stolen property, and others.

Occurrence refers to incidents obtained directly by frontline officers, Crime Stoppers tips, cybertips, anonymous calls, and referrals from nongovernmental organizations.

Arrest is of an individual person (the offender).

Victims are people who were being trafficked. The majority are females aged 12 to 22.

Convictions is the number of offenders that were found guilty.

APPENDIX D: Members of City of Toronto's Steering Committee to Address Human Trafficking

The Steering Committee is comprised of the following City Divisions, Agencies and Corporations:

- Affordable Housing Office
- Indigenous Affairs Office
- Municipal Licensing and Standards
- Shelter Support and Housing Administration
- Social Development, Finance and Administration
- Toronto Employment and Social Services
- Toronto Community Housing
- Toronto Police Service
- Toronto Public Health
- People, Equity and Human Rights

APPENDIX E: Community partners receiving City of Toronto grants to address human trafficking

Community Safety Investment

The Community Safety Investment program, administered by Social Development, Finance and Administration, provided time-limited funding to community-based projects. The program's two primary goals were: to increase access for communities to information, skills and supports that prevent violence and increase safety, and increase the capacity of communities to address systemic causes of violence.

The last intake for the Community Safety Investment funding program was in 2016. Some of the projects approved in 2016 were extended to 2017. This funding stream was replaced by the Community Investment Funding program, approved by Council in March 2017.

Table Two - Community Safety Investment Programs, 2015-2017.

Community Partner	Total Amount Over Two Years	Description
FCJ Refugee Centre	2015-2016 \$92,000	FCJ Refugee Centre implemented a pilot response model which provided comprehensive client-centered services to trafficked persons living in Toronto.
Operation Springboard	2015-2016 \$72,000	Operation Springboard delivered an information-based awareness program to help prevent youth from becoming human trafficking recruiters.
Boost Child and Youth Advocacy Centre	2016-2017 \$87,000	Boost Child and Youth Advocacy Centre designed, implemented and evaluated a pilot project to support young survivors of sex trafficking in Toronto to leave and establish safe, productive lives. The project was developed with the Human Trafficking Enforcement Team of Toronto Police Services Victim Services, Toronto school boards, child protection agencies and other organizations.

Community Partner	Total Amount Over Two Years	Description
Covenant House Toronto	2016-2017 \$96,000	Covenant House Toronto addresses human trafficking by applying an approach that detects sex trafficking and providing direct services to survivors. They did so by strengthening awareness of sex trafficking by teaching industry staff on how to recognize luring, symptoms of a trafficked girl and what actions to take in order to reduce incidents and earlier detection. Industry workers included staff in hotels, security guards, malls, hospitals, and taxi drivers. They also developed school training curriculum and implemented the Runaway Prevention program in high schools to reduce the incidents of youth being lured into sex-trafficking.

Access, Equity and Human Rights

The funding provided through the Access, Equity and Human Rights Program, administered by Social Development, Finance and Administration, was used by community organizations and residents to address human rights, accessibility, equity, discrimination, and hate crime concerns in their neighbourhoods and communities.

The last intake for the Access, Equity and Human Rights Program funding was in 2016. Some of the projects approved in 2016 were extended to 2017. This funding stream was replaced by the Community Investment Funding program, approved by Council in March 2017.

Table Three - Access, Equity and Human Rights Program funding.

Community Partner	Years 2016-2017 Total Amount	Description
Butterfly: Asian and Migrant Sex Workers Support Network	\$94,000	Butterfly developed the leadership and capacity of Asian sex workers who may also be migrants to eliminate barriers to health, safety, social and legal supports so that they can realize their human rights without fear of law enforcement, experiences with labour exploitation, or violence from clients.

Community Projects and Events Funding

In March 2017, City Council approved a new Community Investment Funding grant program - Community Projects and Events. Activities previously funded through the former programs including: Community Recreation, Community Festivals, Access, Equity and Human Rights, and Community Safety Investment, are eligible for funding in the new program.

Community Project grants help community organizations develop a product, tool or resource to respond to a community need so that they can: increase their organization's impact by doing things better, increase community impact by working with others, or diversify who they serve to strengthen access and equity.

Community Events grants help organizations create a neighbourhood event or activity that brings different groups of people together to either make their neighbourhood better, keep people active or help residents learn skills and build leadership.

Table Four - Community Investment Funding, 2018-2019.

Community Partner	Years 2018-2019 Total Amount	Description
Aura Freedom International	\$52,275	Aura Freedom International will provide awareness presentations to Toronto-based schools, homeless youth shelters, and other youth spaces.
Butterfly: Asian and Migrant Sex Workers Support Network	\$50,493	Butterfly will strengthen the capacity and leadership of marginalized newcomers in low-wage and perilous employment. Butterfly will develop resources to increase workers' access to services.
Elizabeth Fry	\$25,500	Elizabeth Fry Toronto will develop and test a psycho-educational resource handbook for counselors working with trafficked victims. Elizabeth Fry will work with other members of the Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network on this project and to ensure the dissemination of the finished tool.
Findhelp Information Services/211 Central Region	\$42,000	Findhelp/211 will leverage existing system capacity to create a sustainable data collective for centralizing non-identifying information on human trafficking victim demographics, needs, unmet needs, and other relevant information.

Community Partner	Years 2018-2019 Total Amount	Description
The Bad Date Coalition	\$5,970	The Bad Date Coalition organized a public event to recognize, honour and celebrate the lives of women lost to violence on the streets and to bring awareness to the issue. The event was held in the summer of 2018.

Toronto Urban Health Fund

Toronto Public Health administers the Toronto Urban Health Fund. The Fund provides one year and three year project funding to non-profit community based organizations to support initiatives under the following three streams: HIV (Human Immunodeficiency Virus) prevention, harm reduction and child and youth resiliency.

Table Five - Toronto Urban Health Fund, 2017-2020.

Community Partner	Years 2017-2020 Total Amount	Description
Agincourt Community Services Association	\$293,530	<p>Agincourt Community Services Association is managing the Massage Parlour/Micro-Brothel Outreach program, which provides weekly HIV prevention outreach services to sex workers in micro brothels and massage parlors in Scarborough. Outreach workers travel to massage parlour and micro-brothel locations each week to build rapport with the owners and sex trade workers, to distribute harm reduction supplies and to accompany sex trade workers to sexual health clinics for testing for HIV and sexually transmitted infections.</p> <p>Massage Parlour: Business where massage services are provided along sexual services to clients.</p> <p>Micro-Brothel: Residential brothels operating in the City of Toronto.</p>
Agincourt Community Services Association	\$223,865	<p>Agincourt Community Services Association is managing the Male Clients Outreach and Education Project which provides outreach through web-based platforms and e-communication to reach male sex buyers in Scarborough. Outreach workers travel to massage parlours and micro-brothel locations each week to provide safer sex supplies and materials for the use of male sex buyers, as well as accompanying male sex buyers to sexual health clinic for testing for HIV and sexually transmitted infections.</p>

Community Partner	Years 2017-2020 Total Amount	Description
Butterfly (Asian and Migrant Sex Workers Support Network)	\$199,311	Butterfly: Asian and Migrant Sex Workers Support Network is managing the Migrant Sex Workers Outreach and Education Project which provides outreach specifically to migrant sex workers across Toronto. Peer workers provide monthly harm reduction workshops at informal gatherings to reduce isolation and increase harm reduction knowledge amongst migrant sex workers.
Maggie's - Toronto Sex Workers Action Project	\$212,574	Maggie's - Toronto Sex Workers Action Project is managing the Indigenous Sex Workers Action Project which provides outreach, a biweekly drop-in and a monthly sharing circles with Elders for Indigenous sex workers in Toronto.

APPENDIX F: Government of Ontario Funded Programs

In September 2017, the Ministry of Children, Community and Social Services, Government of Ontario, announced a total of approximately \$18.6 million to 44 partners and agencies across the province for projects that aim to prevent human trafficking and support survivors. Grants for Toronto-based partners were allocated the total amount of \$3.1 million and the funded period started in 2017.

The Community Supports Fund

Table Six - The Community Supports Fund for multi-year projects.

Partner/Agency	Total amount	Description
City of Toronto	\$885,208	Residential supports for trafficked women and girls with comprehensive, on-site services such as mental health and addictions treatment, education, and legal and income supports.
East Metro Youth Services	\$488,691	Peer mentorship, public education, outreach and case management. Clinical trauma therapy. Supports to assist families with reintegration of survivors.
FCJ Refugee Centre	\$369,289	Identification, intervention and prevention of labour trafficking and exploitation among migrant workers.
South Asian Legal Clinic Ontario	\$156,768	Legal education for victims and survivors of human trafficking and front-line service providers in the areas of criminal law, immigration law and employment law, including e-learning tools that can be accessed throughout Ontario.

The Indigenous-led Initiatives Fund: prevention and service delivery

Table Seven - The Indigenous-led Initiatives Fund for three-year projects.

Partner/Agency	Total amount	Description
Native Family Child and Youth Services Toronto	\$406,325	Comprehensive culture-based outreach, prevention, healing, and treatment services for Indigenous survivors and at-risk children and youth.
Native Women's Resource Centre Toronto	\$678,641	Facilitation of regional working groups to provide education, evidence-based interventions, holistic individualized supports and wraparound resources that empower survivors. This will include 12 community engagements.

Indigenous-led Initiative Fund: capacity building

Table Eight - Indigenous-led Initiative Fund for one-year projects.

Partner/Agency	Total amount	Description
*Unnamed agency	\$154,000	Indigenous survivors and persons with lived experience will be engaged in an advisory circle with Elders, taking a holistic approach that recognizes health and healing as a balance between the physical, mental, spiritual and emotional.

* This agency requested to not be named publicly due to security concerns. However, partners in those communities who work with survivors of human trafficking are informed about the services available to pave the way for referrals.

Special Funding

Table Nine - Government of Ontario provided additional funding to Findhelp/211 Central Region.

Partner/Agency	Total amount	Description
Findhelp/211 Central Region	\$42,000	The Government of Ontario funded the provincial helpline for survivors of human trafficking and those seeking to support them. Findhelp/211 Central Region operates the 24/7 pilot helpline that serves people across Ontario, which is built upon the core 211 infrastructure, supported by the City through Findhelp. The Human Trafficking Helpline was launched on February 22, 2018.